# Step 4: Selection Criteria

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Recommendation** | **Considerations and Actions** |
| Develop selection criteria inherent to the job and in advance of writing the advertisement | * Well defined criteria are based on the essential or inherent elements of the job description * Well defined criteria does not mean narrow but that they have clarity in the qualities being sought * Essential and desirable criteria should be delineated * Job seekers consistently report that vague selection criteria and a lack of clarity around role responsibilities in position descriptions are a deterrent to applying[[1]](#footnote-1). * While the committee may not always be able to think of all potential evaluation criteria the **efforts to define the criteria more rigorously usually results in greater clarity regarding what qualities you are seeking[[2]](#footnote-2)** * Criteria need to be agreed upon before the advertisement is written and before the Committee views any applications |
| Selection is merit-based and the definition of ‘merit’ (ie. hiring on the ability to do the job) is sufficiently broad to recognise equivalent qualifications which may or may not be formal | * A broad definition of qualifications can draw from wider applications including inviting applications from people with equivalent qualifications   + Women and Māori may have acquired necessary skills and abilities through experiences in caring, voluntary, and community work and mahi aroha   + Māori and Pacific applicants are statistically likely to have spent less time than others in higher education which may be reflected in their qualification levels, even though they may have the required experience[[3]](#footnote-3)   **Example:**  If employing professional staff, the criteria “experience working in a large complex organisation” could replace the narrower criteria, “experience working in a tertiary organisation”, when this may be desirable but not essential   * Focus on the ‘what’ that needs to be done, rather than the ‘how’ – people with disabilities or other cultures may approach tasks differently   **Example:**   * `Ability to travel’, rather than `must have driver’s licence’ * Fairly evaluate overseas qualifications; See NZQA [Recognition of Overseas Qualifications](https://www.nzqa.govt.nz/qualifications-standards/international-qualifications/) |
| Selection criteria are benchmarks against which applicants can be assessed thus need to be able to be fairly measured | * Well defined criteria and assessment methods are agreed on in advance of seeing any applications * For each criterion determine how it will be assessed; the type of evidence required, rating scale and what is the minimum that applicants must achieve   + Consider possible parameters of requirements   + Committee should discuss and agree on types of evidence, approach, etc, that would meet the criteria   **Examples**   * + How will advertised criteria such as, *‘Excellence in teaching/research/project management’* be assessed? Is it, number of publications, impact score, success at attracting students, innovations in teaching/research, schedule management, stakeholder satisfaction, performance to business case? etc.   + If `*motivation’* is considered as a criterion, how is it being assessed? Is that valid?   + What skills and attributes are being sought when assessing *collegiality, teaching philosophy, communication skills* etc? * While the committee may not always be able to think of all potential evaluation criteria the efforts to define the criteria more rigorously usually results in greater clarity regarding what qualities you are seeking[[4]](#footnote-4) * Weighting of the most important (or all) criteria can give a more nuanced assessment |
| Create a structured process to support fair decision making | * Develop a template to assist the Committee fairly and appropriately assess applicants against criteria   See **Appendix 2** for examples and the Smart Recruiters \*Rating system |
| Include valuing equity as a requirement for the job | **Examples**   * For team member positions:   “Demonstrated experience teaching/working with diverse groups”  “Commitment to Te Tiriti o Waitangi and equity”.   * For more senior positions:   ”Demonstrated experience in championing equity”,  “Lead strategic decision making and implementation for Te Tiriti o Waitangi and equity objectives.”  See **Appendix 1** for more information on equity capabilities  See [Taumata Teitei](https://www.auckland.ac.nz/en/about-us/about-the-university/the-university/official-publications/strategic-plan.html) and [5D Leadership Capabilities](https://cdn.auckland.ac.nz/assets/simpleForms/hr-69Tables.pdf) |
| Being a member of an equity group is considered a factor of merit | * Diverse staff bring with them unique valuable skills; eg; cross cultural and linguistic skills, performative abilities (of people with autism) [[5]](#footnote-5), understanding needs of a range of diverse student and staff populations etc. * Other considerations are the applicant’s ability to act as a role model for Māori and equity groups, and for in academic positions, their ability to extend boundaries of current research by researching or supervising in non-traditional areas * Such considerations should be made with all other relevant factors and points of merit taken into account. |

1. JobGetter, 2017 Australian Job Seeker Report, 2017, p. 11; https://my.jobgetter.com/job-seeker-survey/. [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Strategies to improve faculty hiring. N. Bhalla. Am. Society for Cell Biology. Oct 2019. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. [Recruitment Guidance](https://www.publicservice.govt.nz/assets/SSC-Site-Assets/Workforce-and-Talent-Management/Implementing-the-Gender-Pay-Principles-and-removing-gender-bias-in-recruitment-processes.pdf) Public Service Commission 2019 [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
4. Strategies to improve faculty hiring. N. Bhalla. Am. Society for Cell Biology. Oct 2019. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
5. [Neurodiversity of the workforce ... E. Walkowiak Science Direct 2021](https://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0040162521001712) [↑](#footnote-ref-5)